Who’s the Fairest of Them All?

The Wicked Graduate Program Rubric

Gail J. Richard
Department Chair
Eastern Illinois University

Tina K. Veale
Graduate Coordinator

Reasons for Rubric

• Increased number of graduate applications
• Investment of time to review and summarize concrete data
• Opportunity to represent qualitative and quantitative information on each applicant
• Method to analyze applicants using same criteria across all individuals
• Desire to emphasize experiences or skills specific to EIU program

Initial Rubric Components

• Quantitative
  – CGPA
  – MGPA
  – GRE Scores
  – Clinical Experience
  – Research Experience

• Qualitative
  – Personal Essay - Writing
  – Recommendation Ratings
  – Recommendation Comments

Organization of Rubric

• Academic Aptitude
  – GPA, GRE, Performance in classes 0-4

• Written Expression
  – Though formulation & organization in personal statement, GRE written score 0-4

• Clinical Aptitude
  – Clinic, camps, volunteer work with persons with communication disorders 0-4

• Problem Solving/Independence
  – GRE, written statement (spelling, organization) 0-4

• Interpersonal Skills
  – Maturity, critical thinking, research experience 0-2

• Other Factors
  – Diversity, NSSLHA, organized activities 0-2

First Rubric Revision

• Academic Aptitude 1-8
  – GRE and GPA

• Written Expression 0-4
  – Though formulation & organization in personal statement, GRE written score

• Problem Solving/Independence 0-3
  – Critical thinking, maturity, attitude, responsible, timely, flexible

• Pre-Clinical/Clinical Experience 0-3
  – Supervisor comments, external experiences

• Other Factors 0-3
  – Minority, diversity, research, leadership

2011 Rubric
**Current Rubric: 20 points**

- Same areas – different weights
  - Academic aptitude: 8 pts.
    - GRE-Q: 2.5 pts.
    - CGPA: 2 pts.
    - MGPA: 3.5 pts.
  - Written expression: 4 pts.
    - GRE-A: 1.5 pts.
    - Reviewer ratings: 1.5 pts.
  - Problem solving; independence; Interpersonal skills: 3 pts.
    - Reviewer ratings: 3 pts.
  - Clinical aptitude: 3 pts.
    - Reviewer ratings: 2 pts.
    - Quantity/quality of experiences: 1 pt.
  - Other factors: 2 pts.
    - Preprofessional leadership or other experiences
    - Minority status
    - Study abroad
    - Work experience
    - Etc.

**Rubric Review Process**

- Initial Faculty Committee applied rubric to all applicants
- Applicants ordered by rubric score – high to low
- Determine cut off point ~ 100 applicants for full faculty review
- Meeting to make case to add any additional candidates under the rubric cut-off score for full faculty review
- Discuss and admit 50 in first round to enroll 30

**Demographic Data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of apps received</th>
<th>Number of apps reviewed</th>
<th>Rubric points possible</th>
<th>Number of first round offers</th>
<th>Mean of rubric scores—overall</th>
<th>Range of rubric scores—overall</th>
<th>Mean of rubric scores—first round admits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>18.03</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>13.96</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>16.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>11.95</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>15.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>12.82</td>
<td>14.75</td>
<td>13.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**So… How well has the Rubric worked for us?**

**Does the Rubric Select Candidates with Strong CGPAs?**

**Does the Rubric Select Candidates with Strong MGPA?**
Does the Rubric Select Candidates with Strong GREs?

Rubric: Prediction of Success in Graduate School

Relationship of Rubric Score to Final Graduate GPA

Prediction Power of the Rubric vs. Other Common Indices

Relationship of Rubric Score to Final Graduate GPA

Percentages of admitted students above the mean of the applicant pool

*Data for enrolled students

*Data for enrolled class of 2007

**Correlation r=0.46 (moderate relationship)

*Data for enrolled class of 2008

**Correlation r=0.42 (moderate relationship)
Relationship of Rubric Score to Final Graduate GPA

- 2009 Grad Class
  Rubric Prediction of Grad School Success

- Data for enrolled class of 2009
- Correlation r=0.71 (strong relationship)

Rubric Evaluation

- 2007: n=4
- 2008: n=9
- 2009: n=9

Final Thoughts

- Rubric provides systematic mechanism for standardized assessment of each applicant file.
- Selects students with high CGPAs, MGPAs, and GREs.
- Guides faculty selection of top students better than CGPA, MGPA, or GRE alone.
- Newest version of rubric strongly associated with final GPAs of enrolled students.
- Use of rubric resulted in graduate students who excelled in graduate school.
- When overruled, rubric was right!